

## TRANSPORT FOR LONDON

### MEMORANDUM TO THE BUS SERVICES MEETING

SUBMITTED BY: LOIC REYES

SUBJECT: ROUTES W12, W13, W14, 549 – CONSULTATION CLOSE OUT

DATE: 6 DECEMBER 2023

#### INTRODUCTION

1. This paper summarises the responses to the consultation for routes W12, W13, W14 and 549 in Walthamstow, Wanstead and Woodford and seeks approval for the associated service changes. The route details are in Table 1 and the contract details are in Table 2.

Route	Operator	Termini		Buses			
		Out	Back	Type	Capacity	Length (m)	Year
W12	East London	Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane	Wanstead Station	SD	40	7.9	2009
W13	East London	Leytonstone Station	Woodford Wells	SD	60	10.8	2017
W14	East London	Woodford Bridge	Leyton, Asda	SD	60	10.8	2017
549	Sullivan Buses	Loughton Station	South Woodford Station	SD	60	10.8	2016

*Table 1 – Route details*

Route	Contract Number	Contract Cost £pa	Revenue £pa	Cost Recovery	Mileage pa	PVR	Current Contract Start Date	New Contract Start Date
W12	QC55502							
W13	QC55503							
W14	QC55504							
549	QC77602							

*Table 2 – Contract details*

2. Details of the analysis are contained in Appendix B. Implementation requirements specific to the proposal are contained in Appendix C.

#### PROPOSAL

3. Following feedback from consultation and conversations with LB Waltham Forest (LBWF), it is proposed to proceed with the scheme as consulted upon. The scheme to be introduced is as follows:

- **Route W12:**
  - Restructured to operate between Coppermill Lane and Woodford Bridge via Church Hill Road
  - Operate at 4 bph Monday to Saturday daytimes
  - Operate at 3 bph Sunday and all evenings
- **Route W13:**
  - Extend from Leytonstone Station to Leyton, Asda via the W14 routing
  - Increase Saturday daytime frequency to 4 bph
  - Increase Sunday and all evenings frequency to 3 bph
- **Route W14:**
  - Restructured to operate between Loughton Station and Whipps Cross via Nightingale Lane Estate
  - Operate at 1 bph Monday to Sunday at all times
- **Route 549:**
  - Withdraw

4. Table 3 summarises the scheme appraisal updated estimated costs.

Route	Scheme	Estimated Gross Cost £pa	Estimated Revenue £pa	Estimated Passenger Benefits £pa	Estimated Net Cost £pa	Benefit to Net Cost X to 1	Estimated Mileage pa	Estimated PVR
W12	Restructure between Coppermill Lane and Woodford Bridge					3.6	295,555	8
W13	Restructure between Leyton Mills and Woodford Wells						129,034	3
549	Withdraw						(32,552)	(1)
W14	Restructure between Loughton and Whipps X						(292,238)	(8)
<b>TOTAL</b>							<b>3.6</b>	<b>99,799</b>

Table 3: Scheme appraisal – updated estimated costs, mileage & PVR

## IMPLEMENTATION

5. The physical interventions required to implement the scheme are listed in appendix C.
6. It is recommended that the service changes take place on 7 September 2024 when the new contracts start.

## RATIONALE

7. The justification for the proposals is as follows:
  - Simplifies the bus network
  - Represents good value for money
  - Improve Outer London connectivity, especially to Whipps Cross Hospital
  - Seeks to meet the business plan objectives

**RECOMMENDATION**

8. A Director of London Bus Services Ltd is asked to APPROVE the implementation for the scheme proposed in this paper, having considered its contents (and BSM papers “Tranche 865 BSM 649 LR” and “Routes W12 W13 W14 549 Scheme Update BSM 659 LR”), the attached post-consultation EqIA, the consultation report and other material considerations.

## APPENDIX A – SUMMARY OF FREQUENCIES AND TERMINI

	Present frequencies & structure				Proposed frequencies & structure			
	AM Peak	Mid day	PM Peak	Eve	AM Peak	Mid day	PM Peak	Eve
<u>Route 549</u>								
<i>MF</i>								
South Woodford, Mulberry Way - Loughton Station	0.86	0.86	0.86	0.86/0	-	-	-	-
<i>Sat</i>								
South Woodford, Mulberry Way - Loughton Station	0.86	0.86	0.86	0.86/0	-	-	-	-
<i>Sun</i>								
South Woodford, Mulberry Way - Loughton Station	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
<i>Toilets available at Loughton Station</i>								
<u>Route W12</u>								
<i>MF</i>								
Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane - Wanstead Station, Woodbine Place	2	2	2	2	-	-	-	-
Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane - Woodford Bridge, Manor Road	-	-	-	-	4	4	4	3
<i>Sat</i>								
Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane - Wanstead Station, Woodbine Place	2	2	2	2	-	-	-	-
Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane - Woodford Bridge, Manor Road	-	-	-	-	2/4	4	4	4/3
<i>Sun</i>								
Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane - Wanstead Station, Woodbine Place	2	2	2	2	-	-	-	-
Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane - Woodford Bridge, Manor Road	-	-	-	-	2	3	3	3
<i>Toilets available at Woodford Bridge, Manor Road</i>								
<u>Route W13</u>								
<i>MF</i>								
Leytonstone Bus Station - Woodford Wells, Horse & Well	4	4	4	2	-	-	-	-
Leyton, Asda Woodford Wells, Horse & Well	-	-	-	-	4	4	4	3
Leytonstone Bus Station to Woodford Wells, Horse & Well	JNY	-	-	-	JNY	-	-	-
Woodford Wells, Horse & Well to Leytonstone Bus Station	-	0/JNY	-	-	-	0/JNY	-	-
<i>Sat</i>								
Leytonstone Bus Station - Woodford Wells, Horse & Well	2/3	3	3	2	-	-	-	-
Leyton, Asda Woodford Wells, Horse & Well	-	-	-	-	2/4	4	4	4/3
<i>Sun</i>								
Leytonstone Bus Station - Woodford Wells, Horse & Well	2	2	2	2	-	-	-	-
Leyton, Asda Woodford Wells, Horse & Well	-	-	-	-	2	3	3	3
<i>Toilets available at Leyton, Asda</i>								

	Present frequencies & structure				Proposed frequencies & structure			
	AM Peak	Mid day	PM Peak	Eve	AM Peak	Mid day	PM Peak	Eve
<u>Route W14</u>								
<i>MF</i>								
Woodford Bridge - Leyton, Asda	4	4	4	4/3	-	-	-	-
Whipps Cross, Whipps Cross Road - Loughton Station	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	1
<i>Sat</i>								
Woodford Bridge - Leyton, Asda	2/4	4	4	4/3	-	-	-	-
Whipps Cross, Whipps Cross Road - Loughton Station	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	1
<i>Sun</i>								
Woodford Bridge - Leyton, Asda	2	3	3	3	-	-	-	-
Whipps Cross, Whipps Cross Road - Loughton Station	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	1
<i>Toilets available at Loughton Station</i>								

## **APPENDIX B – DETAILED ANALYSIS**

### **Introduction**

1. This analysis makes recommendations following consultation on routes W12, W13, W14 and 549.
2. Route W12 is operated by East London between Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane and Wanstead Station at 2 buses per hour (bph) Monday to Sunday at all times. 40-capacity single-deck buses are used.
3. Route W13 is operated by East London between Leytonstone Bus Station and Woodford Wells at 4 bph Monday to Friday daytimes, 3 bph Saturday daytime and 2 bph Sundays and all evenings. An additional school journey is operated towards Woodford in the AM peak and towards Leytonstone in the afternoon on all weekdays. 60-capacity single-deck buses are used with an 87-capacity double-deck bus used for the school journeys.
4. Route W14 is operated by East London between Woodford Bridge and Leyton, Asda at 4 bph Monday to Saturday daytime and 3 bph Sunday and all evenings. 60-capacity single-deck buses are used.
5. Route 549 is operated by Sullivan Buses between Loughton Station and South Woodford Station every 90 minutes Monday to Saturday daytime only. 60-capacity single-deck buses are used.
6. Routes W12, W13 and W14 (and 549) were reviewed as part of tranche 865 and BSM 649 approved consulting on withdrawing route 549; restructuring route W12 to operate between Walthamstow and Woodford Bridge; extending route W13 to Leyton and restructuring route W14 to operate between Loughton and Whipps Cross Interchange. Frequencies would also be amended.
7. BSM 659 amended the scheme following a meeting between TfL and LBWF. LBWF opposed the increased frequency and the use of larger vehicles in Walthamstow Village. The consultation consequently also included a proposal to reroute the W12 away from Walthamstow Village and via Church Hill instead.

### **Consultation**

8. Consultation was undertaken between 19 June and 30 July 2023. 863 responses were received including 17 stakeholder responses. The accompanying Consultation Report sets out the details of the consultation and responses.
9. 512 respondents replied to the question about their postcode. 25% provided a E11 postcode which includes Whipps Cross, Wanstead and Leyton areas, 24% provided a E17 postcode which includes Walthamstow areas served by route W12, 20% provided a E18 postcode in South Woodford areas currently served by routes W12, W13, W14 and 12% provided a postcode in Woodford areas currently served by routes W13, W14 and 549.

10. The main service planning issues raised both generally and by route are summarised below.

### **General issues**

11. The most common issue, raised by 157 respondents, was the impact of the proposals on the elderly, disabled, vulnerable and less mobile. This item encompasses multiple locations such as Walthamstow Village, Nightingale Lane, Forest Road and Whipps Cross Hospital. The comments mostly dealt with the additional walking distance required to access the bus network, the proposed frequency decrease on some sections or the need to interchange between buses which would have a detrimental impact on passengers with protected characteristics.
12. It is considered that the scheme overall improves travel for all including the mobility impaired and vulnerable. This is mostly through improved frequencies for many and new travel opportunities. For example, the scheme results in 26,50 more people now living within one bus journey of Whipps Cross hospital. It is proposed to amend the scheme to continue serving Walthamstow hospital which will address some of the concerns raised during consultation.
13. 59 respondents had concerns about the impact of the proposals regarding access to Whipps Cross Hospital. Respondents either indicated that their journey time would increase or that the hospital would become less accessible as a result of the proposals. The latter includes passengers from Walthamstow Village losing their bus service and passengers from Nightingale Lane Estate due to the W14 not proposed to serve the hospital grounds.
14. 26,500 more people will now be within a direct bus service of Whipps Cross hospital. It is noted that Nightingale Road residents are negatively impacted by the proposals but they will continue to have access to an hourly bus service which will connect to the hospital.
15. 38 respondents requested more information about the size of the vehicle proposed for each route. This was motivated by either concerns about capacity or concerns about safety if larger vehicles were to be used in residential areas. A series of route tests have confirmed that the roads to be used are suitable for bus operations. There were an additional 56 comments classified as out of scope regarding the use of New Routemasters or tram buses.

### **Route W12**

16. 530 responses were received for route W12 to the question "How would the proposed changes to bus route W12 affect your travel?". 198 respondents (37%) said their journey would be less convenient, 108 respondents (20%) said their journey would take longer, 99 respondents (19%) said their journey would be more convenient, 99 respondents (19%) said their journey would stay the same and 26 respondents (5%) said their journey would be shorter.
17. There were 465 comments to the consultation that mentioned route W12. 93 respondents opposed the W12 proposals, 58 respondents indicated their support to the

frequency increase and an additional 24 respondents supported the W12 proposals overall.

18. The most common issue, raised by 107 respondents, was the concern about the loss of the W12 through Walthamstow Village. This item is addressed below in its own section.
19. 18 respondents were concerned that the entire route was being withdrawn despite no mention in the consultation material that this route would be withdrawn.
20. As mentioned above, some respondents indicated that the proposals would make their journey time longer including to places like Whipps Cross, South Woodford and Walthamstow due to the proposed re-routeing via Leytonstone. Some respondents were concerned that this would lead to reliability issues on the route due to the traffic conditions at the Green Man Roundabout.
21. LB Redbridge raised this issue as part of their formal response indicating that their residents would be more likely to miss appointments at Whipps Cross hospital.
22. Whipps Cross Hospital welcomed the increased frequency and new structure as it would expand the catchment area and improve its accessibility.
23. It is noted that the removal of the double run to the hospital will increase on board journey times for some. However, it is expected that this will be more than mitigated by the significant improvement in frequency. The new structure will also increase the number of people with a direct bus to the hospital.

### **Route W12 – Walthamstow Village**

24. Walthamstow Village was mentioned in 126 responses with 107 respondents (85%) opposing the proposal and 19 respondents (15%) supporting the proposals.
25. The most common issue, raised by 31 respondents, was that elderly and disabled people in the area are reliant on the bus network and as a result of these proposals would become more isolated and would struggle to access the alternative stops.
26. 19 respondents indicated that the local community would be impacted as public transport access would be reduced. Various locations were mentioned including GP services, retirement homes, almshouses, shops and restaurants on Orford Road, Vestry House Museum, church services, etc.
27. Some respondents raised concerns about their safety as a pedestrian in the area, particularly at night.
28. Some respondents mentioned that the proposed routeing via Church Hill would put additional pressure on the road and that it would slow down their bus journey.
29. Some respondents indicated that because of car restrictions in place in Walthamstow Village, the bus is their only option to travel.



30. The most common answer amongst supporters of the re-routeing, raised by 8 respondents, were about making the area safer. This would be achieved by the withdrawal of the W12 from Walthamstow Village. Respondents indicated that children playing on the streets and customers on Orford Road are having to share the space with buses and that it is a safety risk.
31. A couple of respondents indicated their support for the proposals because of recurring parking issues in Walthamstow Village that are holding up the buses and stated that the alternative would provide a simplified routeing.
32. LB Waltham Forest supports the withdrawal of the service because of their objection to higher frequencies and bigger vehicles through Walthamstow Village. A collective of local councillors wrote a separate response asking TfL to reconsider the changes and suggested to mitigate the impact by implementing a split service that would partially serve Walthamstow Village.
33. Various community groups and transports groups objected to the withdrawal of the bus service through Walthamstow Village as it would disproportionately impact passengers with protected characteristics.
34. Splitting the route to both serve Walthamstow Village and Church Hill has been rejected as it makes the service less simple; makes it more challenging to operate reliably; reduces passenger benefit; risks future capacity issues and has an adverse impact on net costs.
35. It was originally proposed at BSM 672 to amend the scheme so that the W12 would continue to serve Walthamstow Village. Nonetheless, a different decision was made at the Waltham Forest – Commissioner meeting held on 4 December 2023.
36. LBWF stated at the meeting that the responses criticising the withdrawal of the W12 from Walthamstow Village were a disproportionate reaction and that they did not believe it would be as impactful as respondents suggested. LBWF mentioned again that it would negatively impact their flagship LTN and they will not accept it.
37. As a result, the Commissioner and LBWF agreed to implement the routeing consulted upon. LBWF asked TfL to trial and monitor this routeing for a year and then review the impact of the proposals on Walthamstow Village. LBWF would then reconsider their position on Walthamstow Village depending on the findings from this exercise.
38. LBWF has agreed to support our communication and engagement regarding their veto to amend the scheme and to serve Walthamstow Village.
39. Route W12 will be re-routed via Church Hill Road as outlined in the consultation. As part of our monitoring of the bus network, the operation of the W12 and its impact on Walthamstow Village will be reviewed 12 months after its introduction. Should we decide to make any further changes following that review, we would consult the public and relevant stakeholders as part of our normal practise.

### **Route W13**

40. 370 responses were received for route W13 to the question “How would the proposed changes to bus route W13 affect your travel?”. 175 respondents (48%) said their journey would stay the same, 68 respondents (18%) said their journey would be more convenient, 66 respondents (18%) said their journey would be less convenient, 47 respondents (12%) said their journey would take longer and 14 respondents (4%) said their journey would be shorter.
41. There were 120 comments to the consultation that mentioned the W13 with 17 respondents supporting the proposals and 5 respondents opposing the proposals.
42. Most respondents indicated that the extension to Leyton would provide them with a direct link to some local destinations. Other respondents supported the proposed off-peak frequency increase.
43. Respondents raised concerns about the impact the extension to Leyton would have on the reliability of the service. Respondents opposed the proposals to prevent their existing service from becoming less reliable.
44. Other respondents opposed the proposals because they are current users of route W14 and would be required to interchange between W12 and W13.
45. Some respondents were concerned that the entire route was being withdrawn despite no mention in the consultation material that this route would be withdrawn.
46. All existing trips on the W13 will continue to be possible. Current journey times are not expected to be impacted except on Sundays and all evenings when they should improve. The route extension will also provide new journey opportunities and we are confident that the new structure can be operated reliably.

### **Route W14**

47. 415 responses were received for route W14 to the question “How would the proposed changes to bus route W14 affect your travel?”. 140 respondents (34%) said their journey would be less convenient, 93 respondents (22%) said their journey would be more convenient, 91 respondents (22%) said their journey would stay the same, 68 respondents (16%) said their journey would take longer and 23 respondents (6%) said their journey would be shorter.
48. There were 342 comments to the consultation that mentioned the W14 with 57 respondents supporting the proposals and 41 respondents opposing the proposals.
49. The most common issue, raised by 112 respondents, was about the frequency proposed for route W14 at 1 bph. Most respondents are passengers at stops in Nightingale Lane Estate or Snaresbrook Road for whom frequency gets halved or direct links get broken. Respondents mentioned that they would be losing direct connections to local town centres including Wanstead and South Woodford. Respondents mentioned Nightingale Primary School and Forest School, respectively in Nightingale Lane Estate and Snaresbrook Road, would be impacted by the proposals

as the headway would be unsuitable to meet school times or that capacity issues would ensue.

50. Some of the respondents got confused by the proposed renumbering of route 549 to W14 and commented that the proposed frequency would not be suitable for the existing W14.
51. 35 respondents mentioned that the route will only stop at Whipps Cross Interchange short of serving the Hospital.
52. It is acknowledged that those in the Nightingale Lane and Snaresbrook Road areas are some of the most negatively impacted by the scheme. However, they will continue to be served by an hourly service on all days of that week that will continue to connect to Whipps Cross Hospital as in its current configuration, the entrance to the hospital is located within 400 metres. There is not sufficient spare runtime to allow for serving the hospital grounds without incurring significant additional cost and so this is not proposed. However, the route will continue to be kept under review.

### **Route 549**

53. 289 responses were received on route 549 to the question “How would the proposed changes to bus route 549 affect your travel?”. 144 respondents (50%) said their journey would stay the same, 72 respondents (25%) said their journey would be less convenient, 52 respondents (18%) said their journey would be more convenient, 14 respondents (5%) said their journey would take longer and 7 respondents (2%) said their journey would be shorter.
54. 46 respondents supported the withdrawal of route 549 since it would be replaced and enhanced by route W14.
55. 21 respondents raised concerns or opposed the withdrawal of the route. Most of these comments do not refer to the changes proposed to route W14 to replace the 549. It is likely that the respondents got confused by the proposed re-numbering. Some respondents did suggest that the route should be withdrawn but not replaced by the restructured route W14.
56. A couple of respondents opposed the changes because the extended hours of operation would lead to an increase in noise pollution for residents.
57. All existing 549 passengers will continue to be able to make their journey on the revised structure. In addition existing users will get a higher frequency of service; a new Sunday service and new, direct journey opportunities. It is not considered that the level of service proposed will have a material impact in terms of noise.

### **Final Scheme**

58. An evaluation of the proposals consulted upon in comparison with the scheme recommended to be implemented is set out below.

Route	Scheme	Estimated Gross Cost £pa	Estimated Revenue £pa	Estimated Passenger Benefits £pa	Estimated Net Cost £pa	Benefit to Net Cost X to 1	Estimated Mileage pa	Estimated PVR
W12	Restructure between Coppermill Lane and Woodford Bridge via Church Hill at 4 bph MSat daytime and 3 bph Sun and all evenings						303,261	8
W13	Extend from Leytonstone Station to Leyton Mills via the W14 routeing						95,104	3
W13	Sat daytime increase from 3 to 4 bph						10,145	0
W13	Sun daytime increase from 2 to 3 bph						6,884	0
W13	All evenings increase from 2 to 3 bph						16,901	0
549	Withdraw						(32,552)	(1)
W14	Restructure to operate between Loughton Station and Whipps Cross Interchange at 1 bph						(292,238)	(8)
<b>TOTAL</b>							<b>107,505</b>	<b>2</b>

Table B1: Scheme appraisal as approved at BSM 659

Route	Scheme	Estimated Gross Cost £pa	Estimated Revenue £pa	Estimated Passenger Benefits £pa	Estimated Net Cost £pa	Benefit to Net Cost X to 1	Estimated Mileage pa	Estimated PVR
W12	Restructure between Coppermill Lane and Woodford Bridge						295,555	8
W13	Restructure between Leyton Mills and Woodford Wells						129,034	3
549	Withdraw						(32,552)	(1)
W14	Restructure between Loughton and Whipps X						(292,238)	(8)
<b>TOTAL</b>							<b>99,799</b>	<b>2</b>

Table B2: Updated Scheme appraisal

## Summary

59. It is proposed to implement the scheme consulted upon with a start date of 7 September 2024:

- **Route W12:**
  - Restructured to operate between Coppermill Lane and Woodford Bridge via Church Hill Road
  - Operate at 4 bph Monday to Saturday daytimes
  - Operate at 3 bph Sunday and all evenings
- **Route W13:**
  - Extend from Leytonstone Station to Leyton, Asda via the W14 routeing
  - Increase Saturday daytime frequency to 4 bph

- Increase Sunday and all evenings frequency to 3 bph
- **Route W14:**
  - Restructured to operate between Loughton Station and Whipps Cross via Nightingale Lane Estate
  - Operate at 1 bph Monday to Sunday at all times
- **Route 549:**
  - Withdraw



Map B1: Recommended proposal

## **APPENDIX C – IMPLEMENTATION REQUIREMENTS**

- Toilets would need to be installed in the vicinity of the W12 stand at Walthamstow, Coppermill Lane. Colleagues in IDP have identified a location owned by the Environment Agency that would be suitable on Elmfield Road. LBWF has been informed of the potential location.
- At a meeting with LBWF on 17 November, officers were reminded that the disabled parking bay on Salop Road needs to be removed or relocated because of longer buses on route W12.

## **APPENDIX D – EqIA**

See accompanying document

## **APPENDIX E – Consultation Report**

See accompanying document